

EXHIBIT 101

REDACTED

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
SHERMAN DIVISION

The State of Texas, et. al.
Plaintiff,

v.

Google LLC,
Defendant.

Case No. 4:20-CV-957-SDJ

Rebuttal Expert Report of Professor Zubair Shafiq

September 9, 2024

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Zubair Shafiq". The signature is written in dark ink and is positioned above a horizontal line.

Zubair Shafiq

data at the hour level meant that publishers could no longer precisely match bids with an impression using timestamps.”³²

23. The privacy concern described by Defendant’s experts and [REDACTED] that the data could be tied to individual users is unsupported. [REDACTED] and Defendant’s experts offer no evidence that a publisher actually tied or could have tied the data in the joined DT files to individual users.
24. It is also worth recognizing that, even if it were possible for a publisher to tie data to individual users by joining different DT files, the publisher would identify the user who is visiting the publisher’s website.³³ In other words, even if one assumes that it is theoretically possible, the publisher is only able to tie data to individual users on its own website.

B. [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

³² Ibid

³³ When a user visits a publisher’s website, they enter into a first-party relationship with the publisher, where the user is effectively the publisher’s customer. This relationship is analogous to a customer entering a physical storefront, where the customer expects the store owner to recognize them without perceiving it as an invasion of privacy. In contrast, Google operates as a third party in this interaction, with the customer often unaware that Google is monitoring their activity. It is not Google’s role to intervene in the publisher’s efforts to identify and understand their own customers.

³⁴ Declaration of [REDACTED], GOOG-AT-MDL-C-000073682 at ‘685 (¶ 14) (HCI)

³⁵ Google, “2024 Google Ad Manager release archive: January 29 New joinable Bids Data Transfer file,” <https://support.google.com/admanager/answer/14438060#zippy=%2Cjanuary-new-joinable-bids-data-transfer-file>. Accessed August 19, 2024.